# NORDIC CREDIT RATING'S VIEW ON CORPORATE HYBRID SECURITIES

#### **ANALYSTS**

Mille O. Fjeldstad +47 99 03 89 16 mille.fjeldstad@nordiccreditrating.com

Sean Cotten +46 735 600 337 sean.cotten@nordiccreditrating.com

#### **COMMERCIAL MANAGERS**

Gustav Liedgren +46 736 49 65 43

gustav.liedgren@nordiccreditrating.com

Kristine Klyve Sunde +47 99 32 69 79 kristine.sunde@nordiccreditrating.com Nordic Credit Rating (NCR) notes increasing interest in hybrid debt issued by rated corporates in the Nordic region. In addition to diversifying an issuer's capital structure, at least part of the rationale behind such instruments is to improve a company's credit metrics depending on how rating agencies view their equity content. NCR believes that there is a role for corporate hybrids in an issuer's capital structure to diversify the investor base and support senior creditors. However, there is little historical evidence that corporate hybrids can be loss absorbing prior to a restructuring and for this reason NCR is unlikely to view them as a standalone driver of higher issuer ratings.

## WHAT IS A HYBRID SECURITY?

A hybrid security is a subordinated debt instrument which holds characteristics similar to both debt and equity and can be viewed as equity, debt or a combination of these depending on the instrument's characteristics. Corporate hybrids carry a commitment to make interest or coupon payments, but also possess the equity-like ability to defer instalments when necessary without triggering default. In this sense, they can provide an element of loss absorption before an issuer is restructured and protect more senior creditors in an event of default.

Hybrids are meant to be a semi-permanent component of a company's capital structure. They are long-dated instruments, typically with call dates, and are subordinated to more senior debt and senior to common equity (see Figure 1). Generally, they carry a higher coupon rate to compensate investors for the additional risk.

## LESSONS FROM BANK-ISSUED HYBRIDS

The hybrid debt market grew sharply in the early years of the century as a means for banks to improve their capitalisation and fulfil their regulatory capital requirements. Prior to the 2008-2009 financial crisis, banks issued instruments similar to today's corporate hybrids – long-dated and deferrable but with cumulative coupons, step-up structures to incentivise repayment and non-payment options at the issuer's discretion. However, the crisis demonstrated that such instruments provided little or no loss absorption without regulatory intervention. As a result, the distinction between "upper" and "lower tier 2" instruments was eliminated, coupon step ups were removed and objective conversion triggers were introduced. Bank hybrid instruments are now clearly defined as gone-concern (loss absorbing in a restructuring) and going-concern (loss absorbing prior to default via write down of principal or conversion to equity).

NCR believes that some of the lessons learned from the experience and subsequent transformation of bank hybrids has been overlooked in the construction of today's corporate hybrid debt instruments. In addition, for many corporate issuers leverage and cash flow metrics are more important credit drivers than solvency ratios, whereas solvency and capital metrics are a material part of a bank's credit profile. As such, NCR is unlikely to see corporate hybrid issuance as a standalone driver for higher corporate issuer ratings.

#### **GENERAL VIEWS ON HYBRID SECURITIES**

NCR believes that corporate hybrids can form a meaningful component of a company's capital structure. For issuers, they provide equity-like flexibility at a lower cost of capital and increase investor diversification by attracting higher-risk investors by offering higher yields than senior bonds. Senior investors also benefit from more junior securities in the capital structure, increasing their own expected rate of recovery.

NCR assesses the merits of hybrid securities on an individual basis. Under our Corporate Rating Methodology published 14 Aug. 2018<sup>1</sup>, the standard notching for hybrid instruments is two notches below the issuer rating on companies with ratings in the 'BBB' category or higher and three notches below the issuer rating on issuers with ratings of 'BB' or below.

Furthermore, hybrid securities can receive equity treatment of 0%, 50% or 100% in our calculations of the financial ratios used in our assessment of an issuer's financial risk. In particular, the equity treatment of hybrid securities affects net debt and interest costs after our adjustments. These two values are components of all key metrics for corporates and real estate companies, and for this reason the equity treatment of a given issuer's hybrid debt could affect the overall rating on the company.

In the interests of clarity and transparency, NCR plans to present a given issuer's key credit metrics both with and without equity treatment in cases where it has decided to accord equity treatment to a hybrid security. For example, interest coverage metrics including all anticipated hybrid coupon payments is considered a more appropriate reflection of actual financing costs.

## ASSESSING THE EQUITY FEATURES OF HYBRID SECURITIES

As hybrids occupy a place in the capital structure between senior debt and equity, NCR assesses at what level they compare to equity. The main characteristics for common equity are subordination, permanency and deferability. Below we compare the three most common hybrid securities – hybrid bonds, preferred shares and D-shares – on these characteristics.

Figure 1. Corporate capital structure

Low	Low
	1
+	<b>+</b>
High	High
	₹ High

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://nordiccreditrating.com/governance/methodologies

#### Subordination

Hybrid securities rank below non-deferrable subordinated loans in the balance sheet hierarchy (see Figure 1). Accordingly, they are senior only to common equity and more junior hybrids. Typically, a D-share will have lower priority than hybrid bonds and preferred shares both in terms of payment of coupons and in a restructuring situation.

## Permanency

A hybrid security is expected to be either perpetual or long-dated, typically to fulfil rating agency criteria. Both preferred shares and D-shares are by definition perpetual and therefore fulfil the requirement of permanency. Corporate hybrid bonds can have either a long time to maturity or be perpetual, with call dates typically after five years<sup>2</sup>. To incentivise issuers to call these instruments, bondholders may require an interest rate step-up after a certain period, which effectively reduces the expected maturity of the instrument. To convince rating agencies of the permanence of a callable instrument, issuers commit to replacing hybrid bonds with similar instruments in the event the instrument is called.

## Deferability of coupon and dividend payments

While dividends on common shares are inherently flexible, defined dividends on both preferred shares and D-shares are expected to be paid in most instances. When deferred, the dividend related to both preferred shares and D-shares will typically be repaid, together with interest. Accordingly, the dividend commitment on preferred shares and D-shares is similar to the liabilities of an interest payment on a bond. Similarly, the interest payment on hybrid bonds can be deferred. In some cases, deferral of hybrid instruments will include dividend stoppers, prohibiting dividend payments from more junior instruments in the capital structure until paid in full including interest and ensuring the relative seniority of coupon and dividend payments.

Notably, most corporate hybrids do not include key features associated with bank hybrids (additional Tier 1 instruments), namely non-cumulative coupon deferral and objective triggers for conversion to equity or writing down principal prior to liquidation.

#### NCR'S REQUIREMENTS FOR EQUITY TREATMENT OF HYBRID SECURITIES

NCR can assign 0%, 50% or 100% equity treatment to hybrid securities, based on the equity-like characteristics of a given hybrid instrument. In line with the previous section, the following characteristics would be expected for a hybrid security to receive some level of equity treatment.

## Subordination

We can allow equity treatment for hybrid securities if they are subordinate to senior debt and nondeferrable subordinated debt instruments in a company's capital structure. The subordination of the instruments provides a buffer for more senior debt, which we consider in our recovery analysis, when applicable, and could affect the issue rating(s) on more senior debt.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>For financial institution hybrids a typical five-year hybrid call date allows 10-year debt instruments to receive full capital recognition until the call date given that "regulatory amortisation" generally begins when maturity is within five years.

#### Call and step up features

We allow equity treatment up to the first call date as long as the first step up is at least five years after the first call date and the original maturity of the instrument is at least 25 years.

We anticipate that issuers will most likely call hybrid instruments on their first call date. However, we would expect any step up in coupon rates to occur at least five years after the first call date. This reduces the incentive to call an instrument on the first call date if the company is under financial stress or otherwise unable to issue replacement instruments on the first call date. Issuers are typically able to call at any interest payment date after the first call date, in which case the instrument is no longer eligible for equity treatment.

Individual instruments will always be evaluated on the nature of the actual permanency features, which could allow instruments with multiple call dates otherwise fulfilling the five-year minimum to the first step up or final maturity date to receive equity treatment beyond the first call.

In Figure 2, we present a simplified summary of our explanation of permanency qualifying for equity content.

Minimum 25 years

Minimum 5 years

Minimum 5 years

Step-up date

Potential equity treatment

No equity treatment

Figure 2. Simplified overview of hybrid bond equity treatment

# Replacement commitment

In addition, we anticipate that an issuer will replace a hybrid instrument with a similar or more junior instrument on the call date, which, where applicable, would be reflected in the ratings on the issuer's more senior issues. We acknowledge that in some instances a company's financial situation could change, reducing the incentive to hold expensive hybrid instruments in the capital structure after the call date, in fact potentially improving the overall financial situation of the issuer. NCR would reflect any such changing situation on a case-by-case basis or in response to a company announcement to this effect.

# Deferability of coupon and dividend payments

To receive equity treatment, the issuer of a hybrid instrument must be able to defer coupon or dividend payments, with no time limit. Deferred coupons can be either cumulative or non-cumulative. However, should the company defer coupon payments for a protracted period, we would assess the increasing liability and consider whether it has liquidity issues or if it is selectively deferring coupon payments. This could affect the overall credit rating on an issuer.

Figure 3. Equity content by hybrid security

	HYBRID LOANS	PREFERRED SHARES	D-SHARES
Equity treatment	0 – 50%	0 – 100%	100%

The individual assessment of equity treatment of hybrid securities is discussed and decided in the rating committee based on the features of the issue and in the context of the issuer's capital structure. Should we consider the amount of hybrid securities as a share of total equity and liabilities to be very high, we could adjust the level of equity treatment to reflect this.

#### NORDIC CREDIT RATING AS

OSLO
Biskop Gunnerus' gate 14A
0185 Oslo
Norway
www.nordiccreditrating.com
post@nordiccreditrating.com

STOCKHOLM Engelbrektsgatan 9-11 114 32 Stockholm Sweden

Disclaimer © 2019 Nordic Credit Rating AS (NCR, the agency). All rights reserved. All information and data used by NCR in its analytical activities come from sources the agency considers accurate and reliable. All material relating to NCR's analytical activities is provided on an "as is" basis. The agency does not conduct audits or similar warranty validations of any information used in its analytical activities and related material. NCR advises all users of its services to carry out individual assessments for their own specific use or purpose when using any information or material provided by the agency. Analytical material provided by NCR constitutes only an opinion on relative credit risk and does not address other forms of risk such as volatility or market risk and should not be considered to contain facts of any kind for the purpose of assessing an issuer's or an issue's historical, current or future performance. Analytical material provided by NCR may include certain forward-looking statements relating to the business, financial performance and results of an entity and/or the industry in which it operates. Forward-looking statements concern future circumstances and results and other statements that are not historical facts, sometimes identified by the words "believes", "expects", "predicts", "intends", "projects", "plans", "estimates", "aims", "foresees", "anticipates", "targets", and similar expressions. Forward-looking statements contained in any analytical material provided by NCR, including assumptions, opinions and views either of the agency or cited from third-party sources are solely opinions and forecasts which are subject to risk, uncertainty and other factors that could cause actual events to differ materially from anticipated events. NCR and its personnel and any related third parties provide no assurance that the assumptions underlying any statements in analytical material provided by the agency are free from error, nor are they liable to any party, either directly or indirectly, for any damages, losses or similar, arising from use of NCR's analytical material or the agency's analytical activities. No representation or warranty (express or implied) is made as to, and no reliance should be placed upon, any information, including projections, estimates, targets and opinions, contained in any analytical material provided by NCR, and no liability whatsoever is accepted as to any errors, omissions or misstatements contained in any analytical material provided by the agency. Users of analytical material provided by NCR are solely responsible for making their own assessment of the market and the market position of any relevant entity, conducting their own investigations and analysis, and forming their own view of the future performance of any relevant entity's business and current and future financial situation. NCR is independent of any third party, and any information and/or material resulting from the agency's analytical activities should not be considered as marketing or a recommendation to buy, sell, or hold any financial instruments or similar. Relating to NCR's analytical activities, historical development and past performance does not safeguard or guarantee any future results or outcome. All information herein is the sole property of NCR and is protected by copyright and applicable laws. The information herein, and any other information provided by NCR, may not be reproduced, copied, stored, sold, or distributed without NCR's written permission.